

18th February 2017

5. Service Charges – Audit and transparency

Mel Henson updated the committee on conversations held with Graham Pack BSc FRICS a Chartered Surveyor of [Graham Pack Associates](#), a RICS Regulated Firm.

Graham Pack has audited the service charges of two other Ballymore developments Pan Peninsula and New Providence Wharf.

In both instances, Mr Pack's fees were paid for by Ballymore and recharged through the Variable Service Charge, at a cost of less than £100 per apartment.

According to Richard Horwood and Hanesh Patel, the chairs of the Pan Peninsula and New Providence Wharf Resident's Associations, Mr Pack generally uncovered cost savings that recouped the cost of his fee.

Right now it is too early for a full audit for London City Island because the development is still being built, The 'steady state' on items such as number of staff required in the concierge has not yet had time to become established.

However, there is scope to involve review certain issue now, to ensure transparency and fairness, and in particular:

- **Apportionment.** Ensuring that the service charge is split fairly between each building, and also split fairly between the commercial properties and the residential properties. There have been reports of Ballymore not apportioning correctly, and residents overpaying charges that should be apportioned to commercial.
- **Construction.** Ensuring that work carried out putting right faults is charged to Ballymore and not added on to the service charge.
- **Gym & Pool** Ensuring that costs of these facilities prior to opening to residents (eg: heating the pool, fitness staff employed since November) are paid by Ballymore and not passed onto the service charge.

Some discussion took place about whether we should go straight to Mr Pack or whether quotes from other surveyors should be obtained. It was mooted that Mr Pack is best placed because of his prior experience, knowledge of specific Ballymore issues, and relationships with the right people within Ballymore.

It was also noted that Ballymore is under no obligation to pay for an independent audit/review, so our request is much more likely to be given

Page 4 of 8

a positive response if we propose using the person they are happy with. As Ballymore pays the fees, the onus is on Ballymore to satisfy themselves that he is an appropriate service charge auditor.

Questions were also asked about whether Mr Pack could be independent and act in the best interests of the residents as he is paid for by Ballymore and has worked with them for two years. However, it was noted that Mr Pack is a member of RICS the professional body, and is bound by its rules to be independent and impartial.

Mel Henson & Sokari Higgwe requested permission from the meeting to be given a mandate to speak to Ballymore with a view to Graham Pack's services being engaged on behalf of London City Island, with his fees recharged to the leaseholders in the Service Charge.

18 leaseholders were present at the meeting and all voted to approve this motion.

MINUTES OF COMMITTEE MEETING

27TH February 2017

10. Meeting with Ballymore

Sokari Higgwe and Mel Henson are meeting with Nicky Finn and Dan Cross on 7th March. The committee approved discussion of the following items.

- i. Request service charge review by Graham Pack, who is currently preparing a proposal.
- ii. Request help with getting membership (eg: including in service charge statement and homeowner manual).
- iii. Request information on number of occupied flats so that we can work out what percentage we have as members.
- iv. Request large signs for bins stating Pink Recycling, Grey Landfill
- v. Discuss whether bulk deliveries of pink recycling bags can be arranged.
- vi. Advise that the committee supports having bins in public areas for cigarette butts, chewing gum etc

Page 2 of 3

- vii. Advise that a sub-committee is looking into the foghorn type noise that affects some buildings.
- viii. Advise that the temperature of towel rails is dangerously high with risk of burns, and enquire best person to contact, and possibility of thermostatic controls being installed.
- ix. Request information on public path
- x. Enquire about defibrillator
- xi. Advise that snagging is not being carried out
- xii. Request correct information for the manual.
- xiii. Bathroom cabinets
- xiv. Request temperature in club house room to be reduced
- xv. Request sight of planting plans.

Mel to contact Nicky Finn with agenda.

MEETING WITH BALLYMORE

7th March 2017

MEETING

Date: 7th March 2017
Venue: The Grocer
Present: Nicky Finn (Senior Portfolio Manager) and Dan Cross (LCI General Manager)
Sokari Higgwe (Chair) and Mel Henson (Secretary)

The meeting was held to introduce the newly formed London City Island Leaseholders & Residents Association (LCILRA) and establish a constructive working relationship and communication channel with Ballymore.

1. **MEMBERSHIP** Mel and Sokari explained that we are hoping to get to the legal threshold of 60% of leaseholders as members. Dan Cross advised that there are 444 sold apartments. Mel and Sokari asked for help in increasing membership and Dan offered to send out an email to all residents using the Notifi system. Mel to supply text. (This subsequently took place and increased membership by approximately 60 people).


Nicky Finn asked for clarification on resident tenants and leaseholders who are both members of the LCILRA, in particular committee members who are not leaseholders.

Mel and Sokari explained that the Association wants to be inclusive and engender a sense of community (eg: through social events). The constitution allows for this and there is a precedent set as it is based closely on the Pan Peninsula constitution.

Committee members and sub-committee members, regardless of whether or not they are leaseholders or tenants, have authority from the committee to deal with Ballymore on issues that have been specifically voted on or discussed, and they will report back to the committee. However, only leaseholders are eligible to vote, unless they have been given a proxy vote by their landlord/leaseholders.

Of course, all residents are entitled to make requests to Ballymore, but they should make it clear whether they are acting on behalf of the committee, or as an individual.

2. **SERVICE CHARGE** Nicky Finn explained that all costs are now in apart from insurance. The commentary is written, although not all utility bills have been received so will need to be estimated. The first service charge bills will be sent out soon.

 Mel Henson explained that the Association (leaseholders only) had voted at the AGM in favour of requesting Ballymore to have an independent review of service charges, to be paid for by Ballymore and rebated within the service charge. Graham Pack had been approached as he has provided this service at New Providence Wharf and Pan Peninsula. Mel Henson provided a copy of the proposal from Graham Pack. This was received positively and Nicky Finn intends to take it forward to the directors.


MEETING WITH BALLYMORE

18 May 2017 Nicky Finn & Dan Cross

Garden

Dan advised that the gardens are up for an award for landscaping. As a result the contractors have done additional planting worth £1,000, free of charge.

Service Charge

- 
- a) Graham Pack's proposal was passed to the director, but has not yet been acted on. Mel stated that the request to have Graham Pack review the service charges was as a result of a majority vote of leaseholders at the AGM of the London City Island Leaseholders & Residents Association. Nicky to action.
 - b) Nicky confirmed the bridge is included in the service charges and maintenance currently costs around £16,000 a year.
 - c) Nicky clarified that the service charge is paid **in advance** and the first year is an estimate. As actual costs come in it may go up or down. 2017 will be more accurate than 2016. Sokari to explain this point at the committee meeting on Monday 22nd, to help residents understand.
 - d) Nicky and Dan clarified that there will be some costs associated with the gym/sauna from 2017 as staff were hired prior to the opening. They were working, assisting with set ups and

Page 2 of 3

undergoing training. These costs have to be passed on in the service charge. No electricity, M&E etc prior to opening is being passed on.

Social Housing

Nicky and Dan explained the efforts made to ensure residents comply with the rules. A daily patrol takes place and a daily photographic report is passed to Sokina, the Housing Association Officer. Infringements such as washing on the balcony or litter in the stairwell are reported.

However, the biggest issue so far has been parking and refusing to move vehicles. Residents have blocked the entrance causing problems for construction. A new firm to enforce parking starts work

COMMITTEE MEETING

29th August 2018 –

MINUTES LONDON CITY ISLAND LEASEHOLDERS & RESIDENTS ASSOCIATION TUESDAY 29TH AUGUST 2017 – 7.30pm

Venue: 1508 Grantham

Present:

Sokari Higgwe (Chair), Mel Henson (Secretary)
Neil Blanchard (Social) Eduardo Valfre (Kent rep and Gym) Marie-Claire Ritchie,
Marta (Grantham Rep), Enrique , Tim Allen (Grantham), Florence Vitry
Java 604

Apologies: Caroline Latham, Nick Birdi, Suzy Parker, Emily Homer Osmond, Marta Blocka

Absent: Muti Goloba, Miriam Bandera

1. Minutes of Committee Meeting held on 22nd May 2017 were approved.

The following comments were received by Nicky Finn of Ballymore in response to the previous minutes.

MINUTES: Service Charges

The question was raised weather fixed costs such as bridge, river wall, gym maintenance are apportioned to the 414 flats as at now. Or all the 1700? i.e are we being penalised for being here early?

COMMENT: Unfortunately only phase 1 residents are paying for the upkeep of items like this, we heard last week that Blocks A & M (400 units) will be coming over to us in Apr – Jun 18, once more units come across service charges will hopefully lessen with more people contributing (don't quote me on this though, I'd like to think this will happen)

MINUTES: Entrance Halls

Dan to was going to get the paint work touched up by the regular maintenance person

COMMENT This is being carried out by our reactive maintenance team - Grantham lobby was touched up last week & Kent lobby was done early August (by sales & marketing)

i.

j. Service Charges Graham Pack has not yet been employed by Ballymore as requested. It was reiterated that this is a request from the residents that was voted on at the AGM. Nicky Finn to revisit and put in hand.

i. **Nicky confirmed that the bridge is paid for from service charge - £16,000 per year.**

ii. **Nicky clarified that the service charge is paid in advance and the first year is an estimate As actual costs come in it may go up or down 2017 will be more accurate than 2016. This is partly why the service charge is 25% above the original anticipated.**

. Mel is going to write to

all concerned to find out where the £3.3million is. Ballymore says they have paid it and Tower Hamlets says they have not.

Neil raised the question as to whether fixed costs such as the bridge, river wall, gym maintenance, are apportioned to the 414 flats as now,

On a separate note about the calculation of the service charge

Naveen suggested that square footage is incorrect. Ballymore measures on ceiling space, not floor space.

Daniel said, that Almost every regulation is ceiling space, which includes things like particitions. Also the marketing said net area, which includes the walls.

Daniel has information which he will pass on from his solicitor.

Naveen said it depends what's on the lease. Daniel said it was ambiguously worded.

Audit

This still hasn't happened. Mel and Sokari to find out why not.

When we eventually get Ballymore to carry this out, then we should have a sub-committee meeting with Neil, Marie-Claire and other interested members to ensure that all the audit items we want looking at are. Marie-Claire in particular is keeping a list.

17TH January 2018

4. **Audit of Service Charges:** Juliet asked why we want the audit and questioned whether it was right at this early stage. Sokari explained it is the apportionment that will be looked at rather than reviewing the costs. Juliet wondered if it send out the right signals – does it sound like a message of distress?

Juliet said that it may better value to have Ballymore present the accounts to key committee members. Nicky said she was happy to be totally transparent, and has invoices and purchase orders for everything, happy to share.

Page 1 of 5

Nicky suggested setting up a meeting with Akansh and Sokari to go through everything – a very detailed spreadsheet with multiple columns and tabs to different pages. Mel to arrange.

Mel to compile a list of the questions that have been raised.

Nicky and Juliet can then put together the FAQ doc – how we work out the service charge, when do they have to pay. If it's an individual query, it can be ticketed to be dealt with.

Mel to explain this approach to committee and see if there is agreement that this would be a good first step rather than paying for an auditor, and wait until there are more costs in future for reviewing.

Juliet to arrange for the Accountant, Treasury, Paul Maton Head of Client accounting (Maria) budget to be at the AGM.

Juliet explained there is a new Head of Treasury and the team has about 50% new people. As a result there is a backlog and some delays in the accounts. This was some of the reason for the audit with Graham Pack.

MEETING WITH BALLYMORE

Present: Juliet Self, Nicky Finn (Ballymore)
Sokari Higgwe (Chair), Mel Henson (Secretary) London City Island LRA
Apologies: Dan Cross (Ballymore)

Date: Wed 17 January 2018
Venue: The Grocer

The primary aim of the meeting was to discuss the forthcoming AGM, as well as matters arising from the committee meeting held on Monday

1. **#AGM Venues** Venues were discussed. If less than 60 it can be at the marketing suite in Good Luck Hope. Would not have access at a weekend, so weekday. Juliet offered to set up EventBrite. Can book to 70 because 10 people won't come. Juliet to check the exact numbers. New Prov had Radisson but it was at a special rate because they are resident there – cost would normally be £1000 and we don't have the budget.. Wardian Glass cube only has capacity of 60. Pan Peninsula cinema is also only 60 capacity. Juliet to explore all options and let us know, including food and drink. We mentioned there is approx. £150 left from sponsorship for a party which could be a contribution to snacks if this would help encourage Ballymore to chip in for refreshments and drinks.
2. **Date of AGM** Juliet recommended that the date is a wed evening, as generally weekends are not well attended. 7.30-9.30. Mel to email committee about Wed 7th March.
3. **£1 membership fee through service charge:** Nicky said she had discussed the proposal to charge £1 for membership. Paul Maton needs to approve this. As New Prov did this, Juliet said that it should be fine, and Ballymore is keen to help us reach the goal of majority of leaseholders as members. Nicky to advise when it's approved.

Below are the minutes of a meeting held on 9th February. I have cut and pasted the whole thing rather than showing screen grabs of the relevant extracts

Residents were invited to submit questions in advance of this meeting. These were then grouped into topics where similar questions had been asked.

MEETING WITH BALLYMORE

9th February 2018 – Management Suite

Present: Nicky Finn Senior Portfolio Manager (Ballymore)

Sokari Higgwe (Chair) Mel Henson (Secretary) Marie-Claire Ritchie (Technical) –
London City Island Leaseholders & Residents Association

AIM OF THE MEETING

The aim of the meeting was to get answers to residents' questions about the service charge.

BACKGROUND to the MEETING

Questions were requested from all residents via an open document on Google Drive at <https://docs.google.com/spreadsheets/d/1mGiPbd5zPtINxx2bfAStah54kL1KukisBsFTE0PbtRM/edit#gid=0>

PLEASE NOTE: This information has been gathered in co-operation with Ballymore by the Residents Association as a service to the residents.

The Residents Association is run by residents who are unpaid volunteers. They are not part of the Ballymore organisation.

If residents have further questions, they are welcome to ask Ballymore directly or through the Residents Association.

CONTENTS

- 1. Questions about the process**
- 2. Specific questions about significant increases**
- 3. Questions about apportionment**
- 4. Questions about why a specific cost is included/what the cost is for**
- 5. AOB**

PLEASE NOTE AMENDMENTS TO MINUTES

Pg 2

Cover letter for 2016 balancing charges is ready.

Money doesn't need paying back to construction, £300K was given to us as a set up budget.

Paul Maton agrees the final budget.

Pg 3

Security man the FCC (Fire Control Centre) in Grantham House not reception.

Security manning the barrier to the development is an estate cost.

Last year should read this year.

Reserve fund - £70 per unit.

Pg 4

Insurance certs attached – waiting on revised invoices.

Pg 6

Area schedules attached.

Once 2 year warranty expires leaks will be Leaseholders responsibilities.

LCC was original gardener followed by Maple, Tulip are the current ones.

Pg 8

Lease of land from London Borough of Newham - upon first completion of each private residential unit in phase 1, £50 per unit completed per annum payable quarterly in advance. Once all completed anticipated annual rental cost is £22,850. Phase 2 the same with total annual rent expected to be £75,435 - cost is exclusive of VAT.

Pg 9

Evinox misspelt.

Kind regards

Nicky

Nicky Finn

Senior Portfolio Manager

1 QUESTIONS ABOUT THE PROCESS

WHEN ARE 2016 ACCOUNTS GOING TO BE AVAILABLE?

Due to be signed off next week (w/c 12th February) . Cover letter being made ready. £1000 when people moved in – but to run the development money was taken from construction which needs to be paid back. Bills will be coming out next week.

WHAT IS THE PROCESS (OVERALL APPROVAL OF SPENDING)?

Nicky Finn puts the costs together. The budget is set by senior management. Everything under £3k is approved by Nicky the Portfolio Manager. Everything above £3k is approved by Paul Maton, Director of Estates.

WHY ARE SOME COSTS ARE ESTIMATES RATHER THAN ACTUALS?

Nicky explained 2018 budget is done in November, but some actual bills are never eg: water is still being billed to construction. Thus it is still based on budgets, not actual water costs. This means that some costs are the best estimate. Over time they will be more accurate as actual costs come in.

REQUEST FOR A COMMENTARY ON FUTURE SERVICE CHARGE DEMANDS

The committee members asked if in future the statement could have a commentary explaining

- why large amounts had gone up
- Which costs are not included because they are part of the phase 2 development
- Which costs are currently spread only over phase but will go down when phase 2 residents move in

rather than residents having to ask for this information.

Nicky to pass on this request.

REQUEST TO CHANGE THE WORD ON THE DOCUMENT FROM DEMAND TO INVOICE

Apparently this wording cannot be changed because it appears in the lease as 'Demand' so it has to be consistent. It's a legal requirement.

2. SPECIFIC QUESTIONS ABOUT SIGNIFICANT INCREASES

AUDIT AND ACCOUNTANCY

In 2016 there were few costs to audit. £9,000 was put in as a ballpark sum, which was later revised to £5,000, but this was not the actual cost.

£13000 is for the actual audit (by Landmark) plus a contingency of £1800 for other accounting costs. 2017 is the first year a full audit will take place.

SECURITY

Currently have 6 security guards. Salaries work out at £40k each.

We had 6 now 9. They work 4 days on 2 days off. So this does not mean there are 6 on every shift. If two go off to investigate something seen on CCTV this only leaves 1 left at reception, so this is considered the minimum number of staff possible.

Security at the car parks:

Daytime construction pay to man the gate

Evening and weekends is paid for by the service charge – but only by people who have purchased a right to park. The guard is from an agency which is expensive,

Last year, 3 new people were recruited, because from March they will be doing valet parking as well. (When the current car park will be dismantled. The new car park is in Phase 2 which residents cannot access because it is a building site). These extra staff will be paid for by the Phase 2 A&M apart from a small percentage of £13,000 each (instead of paying the agency). Valet parking will last for a year and then it will be self park.

SECURITY

It was looked at outsourcing, but it was not cheaper. Madigan Gill costs (agency used for manning the main gate) are evidence of this.

Security is an estate cost, but the car parking is only paid for by people who have a Right to Park.

RESERVE FUND CHARGE

This has gone up.

Last year to keep the sq foot charge down, the senior managers at Ballymore (Paul Maton) decided not to collect a significant sum for the reserve fund. Only £10k for the whole estate was collected .

Last year, this caused problems, because money ran out for a short time in December. Reserve fund is now being charged as it should be, and this will continue. This is why it appears to have gone up.

The Archive budget was £50 per unit per estate, and is increasing at 4% a year (ie: £52).

Nicky to supply breakdown by building.

Nicky to ask the accounts team where the money is held – is it a separate account and what interest does it earn? What protection is there if Ballymore goes bankrupt?

M&E (Mechanical & Electrical) KENT BUILDING

Facilities team (Pete & Lauren) sent a breakdown.

Prior to handover wasn't aware what assets were coming

COMMON AREA ELECTRICITY

Marie Claire queried the cost of £38k for Grantham common areas alone. It turns out that this cost was overbudgeted, based on anticipated costs rather than actuals.

Nicky has discovered a problem with the electricity last year only spent £32k. This means there will be money to come back in 2019.

CCTV & SECURITY

Marie-Claire queried why assets were handed over which should have a 2 year warranty, Nicky to email the breakdown to Marie Claire to look over

Nicky confirmed that the security included in the service charge only includes the areas that have been handed over and are no longer in the construction remit. The areas under construction are not manned by the security team employed by BAML and are employed and paid for by the developer, not via the service charge.

INSURANCE

2016 No charges for insurance (in construction)

Insurance invoice in 2017 was estimated to be £167,000 but in fact only spent £2555.

Nicky got an invoice for £190,000. It included an amount for hoarding and banners, so Nicky sent it back because it needs to be site specific – hoarding and banners is part of construction. So now waiting for a revised invoice which will be slightly less than £199,000

Colin Sanders commented £38k-£44k that is specific to Kent block, but the same principles as above apply.

Is there an insurance rebate?

Nicky and facilities team meet with the insurers regularly. Nicky to supply full asset list.

They aim to get the best deal for the development, and use brokers to get the best price across all the developments. As such there is no rebate.

WINDOW CLEANING

2016 it was cleaned by construction – no cost.

2017 – should have been cleaned twice, but was only cleaned once. Cost was £20k.

This is actual, and is well below the budgeted £48k so there will be money to come back on the next service charge.

3 tenders in 2017 – Shadbolt appointed. They will be doing it again this year. Budget is £48k.

2018 – awaiting the contract with revised quote. (Cost goes out to tender each year for a 12 month contract). Will be instructed to clean in February and there will be two cleans this year.

MANAGEMENT FEES

This is BAML – this covers management of putting the fees together and managing the payments etc. It is overheads, salaries and internal commercial costs, (ie: so there is not a profit element on top of an external charge)

2016 was £72k

2017 £167k

2018 estimated to be £163k

3 QUESTIONS ABOUT APPORTIONMENT

COMMERCIAL TENANTS

English National Ballet is not yet contributing because they have not moved in yet.
The formula was developed some years ago.

Approximately:

Commercial pay 15%

Car park pays 5%

Nicky to check actual percentages and let us know.

HEALTH & SAFETY OFFICER

If there's an incident it goes to BAML – it's a portfolio wide cost.

REPAIRS AND MAINTENANCE

This is just for common parts – 'everything outside the front door'. Painting, carpets etc.

Leaks are part of aftercare and not part of service charge.

CLEANING

Costs include salaries, uniforms, training, vehicles. Different cleaning costs for

- ✓ Estate (gardens, litter picking)
- ✓ Building cost
- ✓ Window cleaning

GARDENING

The original garden contract was for 6 months. It is a portfolio wide contract chosen by Ballymore to get the best deal by having a larger contract. Tulip were used, then Maple. No-one was working out, so a consultant was brought in.

The cost is for two men x 18 hours a week, including plants.

Marie-Claire worked out that this is less than £17/hour including VAT (and could be less as it's not know how much is salaries and how much is plants) which seems to be a fair rate.

SPA

Hot rock is **not** included in the service charge as it has never worked, and when it is changed it will be down to original installers. No costs on the service charge - covered under warranty, apart from a few visits by Alex who is on site anyway as part of the contract.

The wet facilities are looked after by Ballymore's portfolio wide M&E contractor NG Bailey. Ballymore is currently looking at a design issue with construction and the original installers in light of operational issues, there was talks before Christmas about extending the gym hence the hamman (hot rock) is still in situ.

LEISURE COSTS

Nicky supplying the costs to Marie-Claire.

DEFECTS

These are paid for by construction not service charge. (Delores and Eddie are construction).

CAR PARK - BREAKDOWN

Car park costs are only paid by people who have purchased a right to park. These costs were included in 2017 - breakdown below:

- 5% contribution towards staff salaries
- Electricity provision
- Water provision
- Security i.e. CCTV, patrols etc....
- Cleaning / yard
- Repairs, maintenance & materials
- Lamps & fittings
- Insurance
- Mechanical & electrical
- H&S provision
- Management fee
- Reserve fund contribution

4. QUESTIONS ASKING WHY A COST IS REQUIRED/WHAT THE COST IS FOR

NEWHAM

Rent paid to Newham for the land the other side of the Bridge.

Nicky to find out what this is, and supply breakdown for this. It is dealt with by the commercial team in head office .

It has gone down slightly to £27,000

Sokari pointed out that LCI is on Tower Hamlets, but the other side of the Red Bridge is Newham,

The commercial units also pay into this.

HEALTH & SAFETY

This is Ashdown (comes under facilities)

Fire Risk Assessment

Water Assessment

Health & Safety Reports

They provide a report with action points that Dan Cross (General Manager) has to action.

10 YEAR WARRANTY

After two years the NHBC warranty comes into effect but it only covers the building – roof, windows, insulation etc. It is nothing to do with HIU units or insurance.

FIRE COMMAND CENTRE

All Health & Safety is fed back to the centre manned 24/7. Fire alarms do not go off in the buildings if there is an issue – it all goes back to the FCC.

It does not monitor anything in phase 2 yet – it will be extended when phase 2 comes on. It is not danger or risk of areas under development. It's part of estate management – all Ballymore estates have them.

SWIMMING POOL COST

There isn't a separate meter for the pool, because Harmony (pays £191k for 6 months theirs has gone up by 20% because Nicky now pays for general repairs) but they pay proportion of electricity including the pool which they cannot use.

Nicky is speaking to facilities to get one put in.

New MD starts 3rd March – Simon Pratt. Currently MD at Portico.

HIU SERVICE CHARGE

Figure of £120+vat was put in the budget as a cost in case it needs to be serviced in future. This was given by Evinonox. A tendering process has gone out – (facilities) 8 companies requested to quote, and most have come in under this.

In the lease there is no reference to HIU servicing apart from Harmony. Residents are therefore not obliged to have it done by Ballymore.

Commissioning date is on the unit – first two years are covered by the warranty.

Once the warranty is ended residents can use their own contractor for pipes, servicing etc. eg: For most Java residents the warranty will expire in June, for most Grantham residents in November.

Dan will send out on Notifii instructions on how to turn the HIU unit off in emergency to save flooding problems etc.

ART GALLERY (IN JAVA)

Inside the gallery is their own individual water meter and electricity meter. It is not paid for by residents.

This is the same for all commercial units on the developments.

5. AOB

INFORMATION ABOUT PHASE 2

The committee requested that information sent to phase 2 residents was shared with phase1 residents too. Nicky to mention to Juliet,

PHASE 2 TIMINGS

Block M is coming over in May and Block A is due in July, with another 420 units we envisage service charge costs reducing, especially estate costs.

END

MINUTES MEETING WITH BALLYMORE

22 Feb 2018

MEETING

22nd February 2018 (amended 23rd Feb to incorporate up to date information)

Present: Juliet Self, Dan Cross (Ballymore)

Sokari Higgwe, Mel Henson (LRA)

Apologies: Nicky Finn (illness)

1. Insurance for Harmony.
 - a. Given the recent fire we asked if it will affect residents insurance. It is going to go through the Housing Association building insurance policy.
2. Venue
 - a. There are currently 51 people registered on Eventbrite. Grocer only holds 40. Subsequently we moved the meeting to the Club House which holds 75 and Sokari obtained AV projector and screen from Arebyte.
3. Ballymore will be running two surgeries
 - a. Aftercare Surgery: Head of Aftercare Jacinda Furlong, Kirsty Mitchell, Helpdesk Manager, and Delores Clarke – onsite LCI aftercare manager, possibly Engineer Eddie.
 - b. Service Charges Surgery: Paul Maton, Maria Charambalas – head of client accounting and deputy Shehab senior client account manager . Possibly Marie-Rose Dorita (Senior Portfolio Manager) – who will represent Nicky. They will have the budget, latest service charge demands.
 - c. Roger Black – presenting on original objective of the estate, goodluck hope project and vision for the future.
 - d. Terry from Fitness.
 - e. Juliet Self
 - f. Dan Cross and a Duty Manager
4. Ballymore will pay for a glass of Prosecco on arrival (not on service charge).
5. Service Charge – we discussed the service charge and the need for an independent auditor, who would work independently for both Ballymore and the Residents. We explained that Marie-Claire has spent 8 hours going through the breakdown and has found several items that she wants to query. Some of these have been sent to Nicky and answers are in hand. During the meeting Mel sent through questions to Juliet and Dan that we have asked Nicky so Paul and his team can be aware of them.
6. Gym Expansion – Roger to talk about this in his presentation
7. We will meet Juliet and Dan at 6pm on Tuesday

END

EMAIL THREAD NICKY FINN and MARIE CLAIRE FEB 2018

Marie-Claire prepared a document which will be attached separately which forms her partial investigation into service charges. (It took her 8 HOURS and she could not give any more time)

As a result of her queries it was agreed that several thousand pounds had been wrongly allocated to service charge and were deducted

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Marie-Claire** <marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>

Date: Mon, Feb 19, 2018 at 2:32 PM

Subject: 2017 Expenditure Report - NOT TO BE CIRCULATED - Service Charge Queries

To: Nicky Finn <NFinn@ballymoregroup.com>, "londoncityislandlra@gmail.com" <londoncityislandlra@gmail.com>, "sokari@hotmail.com" <sokari@hotmail.com>

Hi Nicky. I hope you had a good weekend.

Please see attached your 2017 LCI Expenditure Report which I've added 3 columns to split the costs between Management (64%), Leisure (12%) and Other (24%).

I've highlighted costs in yellow which we would like to query / discuss? Some are agreed set up costs which need to be reallocated. We believe there are other highlighted charges that are also LCI development costs.

Management costs are over £1M - can you please confirm all staff names and in particular the management personnel being charged to LCI?

Furniture and equipment should be set costs? Please advise?

Can you please email the NG Bailey maintenance agreement as their monthly maintenance charge seems very high?

Please advise who authorises gym expenditure and purchasing of equipment? There are some large gym equipment costs?

We need to ensure that any Ballymore initiatives like the running club and book club etc don't increase service charge cost, without AGM prior agreement?

I also think a simple LCI Ballymore service charge guide would be very helpful to email to leaseholders to explain what costs are included and how the service charge is calculated. Also a simple explanation of the gross internal area? Residents are confused and believe they should be charged on the nett internal flat area, is excusing the internal walls. Please advise?

Also, I think the Service Charge should be emailed in future to leaseholders to save on printing and postage costs? Are the printing and postage costs a service charge cost charged under the Management charge?

The Service Guide could also be emailed.

As this is a completely new development, still under warranty with an NHBC warranty, the maintenance and repair costs should be very low?

It would be good to meet again before you leave to run through our queries?

Many thanks.

Marie-Claire

Sent from my iPad
Marie-Claire Ritchie
0771 4058445

From: Nicky Finn <NFinn@ballymoregroup.com>
Date: 13 February 2018 at 11:03:16 GMT
To: Marie-Claire <marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>
Cc: Mel Henson <londoncityislandira@gmail.com>, Sokari Higgwe
<sokari@hotmail.com>
Subject: RE: 2017 Expenditure Report - NOT TO BE CIRCULATED

Sorry Marie-Claire

Just amended my note under Line 20 - £14k monthly management and admin breakdown please?

Kind regards
Nicky

Nicky Finn
Senior Portfolio Manager

[+44 \(0\)20 7536 1904](tel:+442075361904)
[+44 \(0\)77 1566 0453](tel:+44207715660453)

Ballymore Group
161 Marsh Wall
London E14 9SJ

[+44 \(0\)20 7510 9100](tel:+442075109100)
www.ballymoregroup.com

From: Nicky Finn
Sent: 13 February 2018 10:23
To: 'Marie-Claire' <marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>
Cc: Mel Henson <londoncityislandira@gmail.com>; Sokari Higgwe <sokari@hotmail.com>
Subject: RE: 2017 Expenditure Report - NOT TO BE CIRCULATED

Morning Marie-Claire

None of the costs listed on this expenditure report would be a Ballymore head office overhead, please see my comments below, I am going to ask the accounts team if I can go through this with them before I depart so all costs will be allocated correctly.

Kind regards
Nicky

Nicky Finn
Senior Portfolio Manager

[+44 \(0\)20 7536 1904](tel:+442075361904)
[+44 \(0\)77 1566 0453](tel:+44207715660453)

Mel Henson <londoncityislandra@gmail.com>

Thu, Feb 22,
2018, 10:39
AM

to Juliet, General, Marie-Claire, Nicky

Hi Juliet

As promised here are the questions we have asked, and some of Nicky's answers.

This is what Marie-Claire has gone through, so far. There is more to do, but she can't give more time to it.

It is also better that it is done by someone independent who works for both Ballymore and the residents rather than the residents v Ballymore

Also it needs someone who understands what is usual and acceptable, as Marie Claire is a chartered surveyor but doesn't have all the right expertise.

She has spent about 8 hours on it so far, and cannot keep working on it

Best

Mel

Hi Nicky. Get well soon.

Be good to get a response on my modifications.

Thanks.

Marie-Claire

0771 4058445

On 20 Feb 2018, at 08:44, Nicky Finn <NFinn@ballymoregroup.com> wrote:

Morning Marie-Claire

I'm currently off sick but as soon as I'm back in the office happy to meet up again and discuss all the below.

I'm also booked into head office this Friday with the accountants to do an audit on this expenditure.

I'll come back to you asap.

Kind regards

Nicky

Nicky FinN

From: Marie-Claire [<mailto:marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>]
Sent: 12 February 2018 18:01
To: Nicky Finn <NFinn@ballymoregroup.com>
Cc: Mel Henson <londoncityislandira@gmail.com>; Sokari Higgwe <sokari@hotmail.com>
Subject: Re: 2017 Expenditure Report - NOT TO BE CIRCULATED

Thanks Nicky.

I'm confused as to what should be a Ballymore head office overhead and what is a LCI estate charge.

Codes – Column A:

281 – Estate
282 – Private resi
283 – Private Java House
284 – Shared Fabric Java House
285 – Private Kent Building
286 – Shared Fabric Kent Building
287 – Private Hercules House
288 – Shared Fabric Hercules House
289 – Private Globe & Grantham House
290 – Shared Fabric Globe & Grantham House
291 – Affordable Harmony Building
292 – Shared fabric Harmony Building
293 – Car Park
294 – Commercial Units

I have a few queries on some items if you could please explain:-

Line 20- £14k monthly management and admin breakdown please?

Administrator, Duty Managers & General Manager – site staff payroll.

Line 212 Mobile phone charge look high. Why aren't call charges included in the monthly rental?

Gold Telecom are the landline telephone providers not mobile.

- line 447 returfing £4200 seems very high and shouldn't this be part of the Gardener's cost if the turf wasn't very good in the first place?

Residents were walking across several sections of the lawns creating pathways, the turf had to be replaced as it looked unsightly.

- line 453 grass cutting Good Friday. Why are we paying the gardener to come out on a Bank Holiday and pay double time?

Grass was cut on Good Friday due to an event, costs to be reallocated to events team.

- line 563 £16k gym towels! Who made the decision to order these @ £6.58 each with Ballymore's logo.

Juliet Self ordered these, they will be allocated to set up budget in the audit.

Line 576 - £4866 fitness instructor placement fee?

Leisure staff recruitment fee, accrued for in 2016 accounts and will be allocated to set up budget in the audit.

Maintenance Agreement - monthly charge £17843. What does this provide? Back up please.

M&E contract with NG Bailey.

Lines 652-656 pest control boxes seem very expensive?

These are the refuse bins in the bin store not pest control boxes.

Line 681 SVC Man Fee Building G £11k for what?

Quarterly Management fee for Globe & Grantham.

Line 1314 Apt 1702 why is this £4627 charged to Grantham? This should be back charged to the estate agent. It was agreed that any costs associated with Apt 1702 problems would not be charged.

Legal costs will be added to the landlord service charge account.

Surely residents can't be charged as a result of a failure by an agent to secure a reasonable tenant?

It would be good to get some back up for the leisure salary and Security staff monthly average costs.

Line 1249 – December Leisure Payroll - £9,699.84
Line 291 – December Security Payroll - £23,721.75

Many thanks.

Marie-Claire
0771 4058445

Rearie-Claire <marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>

Tue, Feb 13,
2018, 1:52
PM

to me, Sokari

Hi Mel and Sokari. Some of the questions are impossible for us to answer.

I'd like to meet with you and Sokari soon to discuss our role and how much we are willing to take on.

I'm not keen to take on the responsibility of checking / auditing the service charge. When are we appointing the consultant?

There are some principles that need clarifying and explaining to residents.

I'm not an accountant or service charge expert by any means but I understand costs.

I think we need a simple service charge guide to explain what costs are chargeable and costs relating to:-

Phase 2

Defects.

Maintenance - why and what?

There should be no costs charged for any works within flats?

I think if we get together ASAP, we can ask Nicky to explain.

We have the service charge headings.

Apologies as I'm between meetings.

Nicky's email is useful with her comments. I need to review.

Thanks.

Marie-Claire

0771 4058445

On 13 Feb 2018, at 10:46, Mel Henson <londoncityislandlra@gmail.com> wrote:

Hi Marie Claire

I have had the following questions come in from Residents. I don't want to confuse things - is it best for you to ask these next time you're speaking to Nicky so that she only gets one set of questions, or would you rather I pass them on. If you feel any of the questions are not worth asking, because they've already been answered in another way, then please say.

Thank you

Mel

NEW QUESTIONS RECEIVED	Adjustments of over-estimates			
TYPE OF QUERY	SUBJECT	QUERY	FROM	COMMENTS
General	Overestimates - money to come back	When there is money to come back, phase 2 will be open. How can we be sure it is rebated to the right people?	P Henson	
Breakdown	Inside and outside breakdown	Could you please ask if it is not possible to break down costs between what we are paying for inside the flats and what we are paying for outside the flats. A friend of mine is a Ballymore equivalent himself with his own building and this was his clear suggestion. He says our bills are not clear.	C Latham	

Suggestion	Concierges/Night Guards	Would it be possible to have night guards on duty instead of concierges at night.	C Latham	Concierges don't do concierges duties at night and so night guards could be substantially cheaper
What is the cost?	Sundry items	Would it be possible to have a breakdown of the actual costs of what is bought on our service charge's behalf	C Latham	I have heard on several occasions that staff cannot buy cheaply off Amazon but have to use Ballymore suppliers. This takes a long time and it seems to me a little dubious since the compost bin was high on £200 when they cost £30 on amazon and the same for a simple ball for use in the gym. Is it possible to see more clearly how much we are overpaying on such materials and the reasons why we have to use such suppliers?
Process	Budget Setting	Could residents be part of the budget setting	C Latham	
Process	Third parties	Do they have a process in place to ensure no related third parties are used.	Q Su	

Marie-Claire <marieclaireritchie@hotmail.com>

Thu, Mar 22,
2018, 3:52
PM

to Paul, me, Juliet, General, Sokari

Hi Paul. Can you please explain why the service charge was only £3.50/sqft in 2016 and increased to £5.65/sqft Budget for 2018 and list what was excluded from 2016 please?

Many thanks.

Marie-Claire

0771 4058445

Paul Maton <PMaton@ballymoregroup.com>

Thu, Mar 22,
2018, 4:31
PM

to Marie-Claire, me, Juliet, General, Sokari

Hi Marie-Claire

I'll go through the figures but a number of initial costs were covered by the landlord and some services were delayed e.g. Leisure which would account for the lower costs. In terms of the £5.65, we were anticipating that the two new blocks would come online earlier and take a share of the estate and residential services but that obviously hasn't happened. I'll undertake a review and include in the commentary to go out and look to get some actuals to see what the likely outcome for the first six months is.

Thank you

Paul

b) 2016 accounts June have been prepared. Cost is coming out at maximum £3.50 per sq ft (annual equivalent). BAML did not send out service charge applications for payment for the period Jun – Dec 2016 but did have the service charge sums paid on completions. Additional note - For those leaseholders who completed earlier in 2016 there may be an additional sum to pay and for those that completed later a credit to the account. This will be detailed in statements that will be sent to residents

c) 2017 accounts will be ready by the end of April. Suggest another public meeting when the budgets come back . These will be actuals.

d) Paul has looked through budgets noting that they are budgets, not actuals. £4.71 per sq ft was an estimate issued to Sales in 2016 but based on 2015 pricing and noting the budget for Leisure only covered a part period to reflect the late opening. The full Leisure cost has added another 40p - £5.11. The 2017 budget increased to £5.23. Now it's come out at circa £5.65 per sq ft for the first half of 2018. Paul explained why it has gone up so much.

- Increased reserve account
- Revaluation of insurance adding 9.5p per sq ft
- More assets on mechanical and electrical.

What has not been taken into account is economics of scale when new residents come in. When first two buildings come on board increasing the floor area by 271,000sq ft to 611,000 sq ft. budget will be at £5.05/sq foot.

Most of infrastructure is here. The

Benchmark figure from July this year is £5.05/sq ft. All this is going to be in the detail that will be sent out.

At the moment it's a budget –

MINUTES OF AGM – 27 FEB 2018

5. Voting to increase membership via a one-off £1 levy on service charge

The chair explained that gaining formal recognition requires 60% of leaseholders to be members (currently approx. 20%)

There is a precedent at another Ballymore development New Providence Wharf – Ballymore charged £1 membership through service charge. This meant that all leaseholders became members.

This was put to the meeting and voted carried by a show of hand

Ballymore to action.

14. Vents. A question was raised about the ugly box that has been put on top of the kitchen shelving that looks like a Rentokil box. Roger to look into this.

PAUL MATON then took the floor to answer questions about service charges. Director of Estates at Ballymore.

Nicky Finn is leaving the company on 8th March so Paul Maton is handling her role in the meantime.

- a) The committee has asked Paul to prepare a fact sheet about the service charges and Marie-Claire and Mel Henson will work with him to produce this.
- b) 2016 accounts June have been prepared. Cost is coming out at maximum £3.50 per sq ft (annual equivalent). BAML did not send out service charge applications for payment for the period Jun – Dec 2016 but did have the service charge sums paid on completions. Additional

Page 3 of 6

note - For those leaseholders who completed earlier in 2016 there may be an additional sum to pay and for those that completed later a credit to the account. This will be detailed in statements that will be sent to residents

c) 2017 accounts will be ready by the end of April. Suggest another public meeting when the budgets come back. These will be actuals.

d) Paul has looked through budgets noting that they are budgets, not actuals. £4.71 per sq ft was an estimate issued to Sales in 2016 but based on 2015 pricing and noting the budget for Leisure only covered a part period to reflect the late opening. The full Leisure cost has added another 40p - £5.11. The 2017 budget increased to £5.23. Now it's come out at circa £5.65 per sq ft for the first half of 2018. Paul explained why it has gone up so much.

- Increased reserve account
- Revaluation of insurance adding 9.5p per sq ft
- More assets on mechanical and electrical.

What has not been taken into account is economics of scale when new residents come in. When first two buildings come on board increasing the floor area by 271,000sq ft to 611,000 sq ft. budget will be at £5.05/sq foot.

Most of infrastructure is here. The

Benchmark figure from July this year is £5.05/sq ft. All this is going to be in the detail that will be sent out.

At the moment it's a budget –

At the moment it's a budget –

e) Paul Maton was asked whether leaseholders can have sight of the audited accounts and supporting invoices and answered absolutely yes

.

f) It was stated that the information was really useful but it would have been helpful to have had the reasons why it's gone up.

g) Paul Maton said that the accounts are moving to a new system, which will show more detailed breakdown by accounts.

h) One person said that in August 2016 the estimate was being quoted as £4.65 through sales and very disappointing when it's £5.15. This has implications for household budgeting for the buyers and for potential re-sale of the property. Paul apologised for this and said that he has requested all the sales literature to find out why it happened and change it going forward.

i) Reserve levels are low and will need to be a gradual increase for future major works.

Page 4 of 6

j) Service charge surgeries. It was requested to have them on a regular basis. Paul said he would liaise with Dan Cross to set it up.

j) Service charge surgeries. It was requested to have them on a regular basis. Paul said he would liaise with Dan Cross to set it up.

k) Reserve levels – Paul was asked what controls are in place to protect the money eg: if Ballymore goes bust. Paul Maton said it's held in trust to protect it.

l) Insurance. John Dembitz was previously chair of a property insurance company. He stated that there is a discount, which is rebated. Specific query, how much was received, and what has happened to it. Paul promised to look into it and respond.

m) Car parking spaces. Are Ballymore rebating the parking of suppliers? Paul to investigate.

o) A resident asked if it would be possible to pay by direct debit. Paul answered that his facility in the process of being set up – but it will not monthly.

p) Related third party. A resident asked what is in place to prevent this. Paul Maton said there is a procurement process. Benchmarks provided eg: audit and accounting fee. Ballymore charge £15,k for auditing fee. Other developments charge £2-3k for audit and accounting. This is similar level of buildings. Paul Maton to check. Additional note - the current quoted figure is £10,900 + VAT to which a contingency has been added but is for the external account work on both Phase 1 & 2. Often direct comparisons with other sites can be difficult to compare. Need to look at specifics and similarities in terms of provision. This is where the independent audit will help to get answers

q) Defects eg: in spa. While it's in warranty, there are no costs through service charges.

r) Official suppliers. A resident asked why can staff not buy things. Paul explains that the majority of things are bought through a supplier, but here have been issues in the past with staff members purchasing items, such as issues around releasing credit cards, and how the payments are tracked and documenting that it was a better buy. It is something that could be given to the auditor to look into. Paul explained that the volumes are huge – in excess of £5m per year. The administration on purchasing would potentially outweigh the minor savings.

s) Heating: Paul explained that we pay for maintenance of plant through the service charge.

t) Motivation and incentive to keep costs down. Paul said he wants residents to feel happy with where they live and satisfied with value for money, a positive experience. There are some legislative issues that have to be complied with. Ballymore put in place very high service levels in agreements with suppliers to try and ensure that things work, like lifts, heating etc rather than cutting corners.

Subsequently Paul Maton responded by email to the following question from Committee Member Marie-Claire Ritchie:

Can you please explain why the service charge was only £3.50/sqft in 2016 and increased to £5.65/sqft Budget for 2018 and list what was excluded from 2016 please?

Many thanks.

Marie-Claire

A: I'll go through the figures but a number of initial costs were covered by the landlord and some services were delayed e.g. Leisure which would account for the lower costs. In terms of the £5.65, we were anticipating that the two new blocks would come online earlier and take a share of the estate and residential services but that obviously hasn't happened. I'll undertake a review and include in the commentary to go out and look to get some actuals to see what the likely outcome for the first six months is.

15. AOB

Chartered Surveyors



Mel Henson
London City Island

1 March 2017

BY EMAIL ONLY

Dear Mel

London City Island

Further to our discussions, I set out below my thoughts for looking at the service charges at London City Island

As we discussed, it's a little early to look at the reasonableness of the costs as it will take a couple of years before the site gets to a 'steady state'. This is because it takes a while for the buildings to settle down with the staff numbers and for the snagging works to be completed before repairs and maintenance are carried out. However I can look at various elements of the development now.

These areas are:

1. To check whether the apportionments paid by the lessees of the buildings are correct
2. To check whether the costs are put into the correct headings across the various schedules
3. To check whether any portfolio wide costs have been properly apportioned to London City Island
4. Make any recommendations, if required, for any adjustments to the apportionments or cost allocations
5. To check that any snagging items or capital works are not put through the service charge, which will include the costs for the gym prior to it being available to the residents

With regard to fees, I have agree in the past with Ballymore and the residents that I act on an independent basis with the cost paid by Ballymore but put through the service charge account as it will benefit all residents.

The fees for the other properties are on the basis of £250 per hour plus VAT

CP House, Otterspool Way
Watford, Herts WD25 8HR
Tel: 020 8950 4567 Fax: 020 8950 5044

Graham Pack BSc FRICS

Any report would be sent to both Ballymore and the residents

There will no doubt be other areas that you may wish me to look at and comment on when I start looking at the information provided

Please call if you wish to discuss anything

Kind regards

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Graham Pack', is written over a rectangular area with a light grey dotted background.

GRAHAM PACK
graham@gpa.uk.com

6. Service Charge

Following on from the AGM, these are the key issues:

- a. **Fact Sheet** - Paul Maton to work with Marie-Claire and Mel to produce. Include information about the high service level agreements that are expensive but hopefully will mean fewer repairs so will be cheaper in the long run.
- b. **2017 Accounts** – Setting up a public meeting when the budgets come back
- c. **Sight of audited accounts and actual invoices.** Get hold of it.
- d. **Service Charge Surgeries** -Set up
- e. **Insurance** – John Dembitz issue
- f. **Car Parking** – Rebate from car parking suppliers
- g. **Auditor** - When to appoint them (and follow through the initial work Marie-Claire did identifying certain issues).
- h. **Nicky Finn's replacement** Introduction to be arranged when appointed.
- i. **District Heating** – If settings are wrong the

It was suggested to pick up half a dozen key issues rather than trying to do everything.

A sub-committee was formed to meet with Ballymore to discuss this.

Neil, Sokari, Tom, Meenal, John – Neil to arrange an internal meeting and then with Ballymore. Mel to attend if required to write the minutes.

7. Building Reps

Service Charge surgeries

Dates have been set up and sent round.

Neil to be aware and possibly attend. Mel and Sokari to speak to Neil.

Service Charge

Balancing charge of a few hundred pounds has now been sent.

When completed property, £1000 was paid. Some were given a credit (eg: if they moved in in November) whereas Java and Kent (who moved in early) had to pay more.

Dan to find out what it covers, as the gym etc were not open at that time.

Service Charge Review by Graham Pack

2016 Accounts have been finalised, which is why the balancing charge has been sent out.

Dan explained that we are waiting for accounts to be finalised for 2017 and then it will take place. Nicky did all the background work to it before she left.

to join the next picking parties.

£1 levy for membership

Sokari mentioned that he has seen the £1 charge on his statement from the property he owns in New Prov, so that the precedent is there. We are currently opening the bank account to enable this.

Twine

Still no news.

MEETING

Wed 5th September 2018

The Grocer

Ballymore: Dan Cross, Caspar Luiken

Residents Association: Sokari Higgwe, Mel Henson

The meeting was held for Dan to introduce Caspar, the new 'Resort Director', and for the RA to brief Caspar on the key issues affecting residents.

Caspar outlined his extensive career in the hospitality industry which included many years managing leading hotels, such as Hilton, in Europe and the Caribbean.

The following issues were discussed.

1. **Review of Service Charges** Mel and Sokari explained that the RA had voted to have an independent review. We are waiting for the accounts to be finalised. Graham Pack has already done this for Pan Peninsula and New Providence. This would cover apportionment, identifying what are construction costs and what are service charge costs and a view on the fairness of the charges. Caspar provided his assistance and is available to meet with Graham Pack to discuss expectations and outcome of the review.
2. **Forecasting** Caspar said that he was working to introduce forecasting. Mel and Sokari welcomed this as it will be vital going forwards to know what sort of ongoing replacement/higher maintenance costs will be coming so that the reserve fund can be built up and be enough to cover anticipated costs.

Service Charge

Service Charge

At the meeting on 10th October We reiterated the request for a review by Graham Pack, independent auditor.

Mel to forward the latest correspondence where we were asked if we wanted certified or audited accounts to work from. This has subsequently been actioned.

3

Ballymore has now agreed to carry out the review of service charges with the independent auditor. Mel has been asked to supply details of the Auditor Graham Pack so that Ballymore can put this in hand.

It was noted that several people wanted to meet with Graham Pack with specific queries for him to look at as part of the review, including Colin Sanders, John Buckley, Marie-Claire and John Dembitz.

It was noted that we are still waiting for sight of the fact sheet about the service charge.

Minutes

Ad hoc meeting with Ballymore

17th December 2018 – The Grocer


Present: Sokari Higgwe, Mel Henson (RA)

Caspar Luiken, Dan Cross (Ballymore)

The meeting was called at the request of Caspar Luiken, as he wished to personally let the RA know of his promotion to Head of Operations and Dan Cross' promotion to Resort Manager in the New Year.

This means that Dan will now have full budgetary responsibility for LCI as well as managing it.

There was no formal agenda, but we went on to discuss the following:

-  • **Independent Service Charge Review:** Dan agreed to help progress this and get it put in hand before the next AGM in February 2019
- **Cody Dock:** Caspar advised a further meeting will take place with several interested parties including Thames Water to help create a through path and develop activities. All agreed this is a very positive collaboration with the wider community.

stretch of the path can be opened up. It's owned by a warehousing company who do not want it open as they are concerned it is a security risk.

REVIEW of SERVICE CHARGE

Mel to send Caspar minutes of the AGM's where it was voted on to have the service charge review and other relevant information, to assist with moving this forward.

SECURITY

Caspar said that Ballymore is focussing to improve security across its business and be more pro-active and less reactive. He is starting to work more closely with the police. e.g.: